

From:

### Deane H. Bartlett (3RC20)

Senior Assistant Regional Counsel U. S. Environmental Protection Agency Region III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029

Tel.: (215) 814-2776

Fax: (215) 814-2603

EPA REGION III

Dun, Clark of the EAP \_\_\_\_ Number of pages (including cover): \_\_\_\_\_\_

Subject: Response to WASA Motion For Reconsideration Appeal NOS. 05-22, 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12

This facsimile contains privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the addressee(s) named above. If you are not the intended recipient of this facsimile transmission, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination or copying of this facsimile is strictly prohibited. If you have received this facsimile in error, please immediately notify the sender at the above phone number and return the original facsimile to the above address by mail.



# UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-2029

April 11, 2008

#### Via Telefax and Federal Express

Ms. Eurika Durr Clerk of the Board, Environmental Appeals Board U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1341 G Street N.W., Sixth Floor Washington, DC 20005

Re: Response to WASA Motion for Reconsideration

Permit Number: DC 0021199

EAB Appeals Nos. 05-02, 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12

Dear Ms. Durr:

Enclosed please the original and five copies of the above-referenced document, which was filed via telefax today and which I am also serving on the other parties in these matters.

Please contact me at 215-814-2776 if you have any questions.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Deane H. Bartlett

Sincerely,

Senior Assistant Regional Counsel.

#### Enclosure

cc: regular mail (with enclosure):

David Baron, Esquire - EarthJustice Legal Defense Fund

David Evans, Esquire - McGuireWoods LLP

John Mueller, Esquire - Chesapeake Bay Foundation

F. Paul Calamita, Esquire - Aqualaw

#### U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BOARD U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY WASHINGTON, D.C.

	_			್ತಾರ್ 	S S
	_ )		:> <u>+</u> 1,2,	(Frite)	in iii
In re:	)		S	1000 to 1000 t	
Blue Plains Wastewater Treatment Plant	)	MDDES Assess Nos. 05 (	)     B	200	
blue Flams wastewater [featment Flam	)	NPDES Appeal Nos. 05-0 07-10, 07-11 and		110-date	
NPDES Permit No. DC 0021199	į	07-12			
entre grande de la companya de la c La companya de la co	) ),				

## REGION III RESPONSE TO DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA WATER AND SEWER AUTHORITY'S MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION

The United States Environmental Protection Agency Region III (Region) hereby responds to the April 1, 2008 District of Columbia Water and Sewer Authority (WASA) Motion for Reconsideration of the Environmental Appeals Board (Board) March 19, 2008 Order denying WASA's petition for review of the Region's decision to include a total nitrogen limit in the April 5, 2007 modified National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit for WASA's Blue Plains facility. WASA has asked the Board to reconsider that portion of the Order rejecting WASA's challenge to the total nitrogen limit based on deficiencies in the allocation process.

Under 40 C.F.R. § 124.19(g), motions for reconsideration "must set forth the matters claimed to have been erroneously decided and the nature of the alleged errors."

Reconsideration is generally reserved for cases in which the Board is shown to have made a

demonstrable error, such as a mistake of law or fact. See In re Gary Development Co., RCRA (3008) Appeal No. 96-2, at 2 (EAB, Sept. 18, 1996) (Order Denying Motion for Reconsideration); "The reconsideration process 'should not be regarded as an opportunity to reargue the case in a more convincing fashion. It should only be used to bring to the attention of the [Board] clearly erroneous factual or legal conclusions." EAB Practice Manual at 37-38 (quoting from In re Town of Ashland Wastewater Treatment Facility, NPDES Appeal No. 00-15, slip op at 2 (EΛB Apr. 9, 2001).

WASA has failed to meet its burden under this high standard. First, WASA has not articulated a legal or factual basis as to why the Board's Decision that it had no jurisdiction to review the underlying allocation was erroneous. The Board correctly understood that the allocation process and the permitting process are separate and distinct. (Order at 44-45). As the Board pointed out, it is the effluent limitation in the permit, and not the underlying allocation of nitrogen, that falls within the Board's jurisdiction to review. Id. at 44.

Similarly, WASA's allegation that the Board's finding that the Region adequately responded to comments concerning the nitrogen limit was erroneous is not correct. As the Board pointed out, "[t]he Region dedicated ten pages of its Response to Comments document to WASA's comments." Order at 47. This includes response to WASA's comment regarding the relative contributions of the Potomac and the Susquehanna rivers. (Response to Comments p. 21-22).

In filing this motion, WASA is simply attempting to reargue this case, which was

amply addressed in briefs and at oral argument. WASA has not met the standard for establishing a basis for reconsideration. Therefore, the Motion for Reconsideration should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

William C. Early Regional Counsel

Deane H. Bartlett Senior Assistant Regional Counsel EPA, Region III

OF COUNSEL:

Sylvia Horwitz
Office of General Counsel
United States Environmental Protection Agency

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that Respondent's Response to WASA's Motion for Reconsideration in Appeal Nos. 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12, was served on this date as set forth below:

A copy was telefaxed and the original and five copies were mailed by Federal Express to:

Ms. Eurika Durr Clerk of the Board, Environmental Appeals Board U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1341 G. Street, N.W., Sixth Floor Washington, DC 20005

One copy was mailed by first class mail, postage prepaid to counsel for each of the Petitioners:

Chesapeake Bay Foundation:

Amy McDowell, Esquire
Jon A. Mueller, Esquire
Chesapeake Bay Foundation
Philip Merrill Environmental Center
6 Herndon Avenue
Annapolis MD 21403

District of Columbia Water and Sewer Authority:

David E. Evans, Esquire McGuireWoods LLP One James Center 901 East Cary Street Richmond, VA 23219-4030 Friends of the Earth and Sierra Club:

Jennifer C. Chavez, Esquire David Baron, Esquire Earthjustice Legal Defense Fund 1625 Massachusetts Ave., NW Suite 702 Washington, DC 20036-2212

#### **NACWA**

F. Paul Calamita, Esquire AquaLaw PLC 6 South 5<sup>th</sup> Street Annapolis, MD 21403

Date: 4/11/82

Deane H. Bartlett

Senior Assistant Regional Counsel

Office of Regional Counsel

EPA Region Ill

1650 Arch Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029

Telephone: (215) 814-2776

Fax: (215) 814-2603